"I want to learn that": Musicking, identity, and resistance in a Palestinian Music Academy

Carol Frierson-Campbell and Keumjae Park

"I want to learn that": Musicking, Identity, and Resistance in a Palestinian Music Academy

Carol Frierson-Campbell and Keumjae Park
William Paterson University of New Jersey

Our theoretical aim in this paper is to interrogate the potential for musicking — Christopher Small's (1989) conception of the musical act, which does not separate musical participation from the musical product — to open up, through a destabilizing performance of cultural hybridity, what Bhabha (2008) calls the third space of enunciation. Based on preliminary field research, we find that practices of music teaching and learning centered in and around the Palestine Music Academy (pseudonym) provide evidence that musicking can be a subversive practice of resistance that disrupts symbolic systems that serve to dominate and control marginalized people. The paper reflects on the connection between musicking, identity, and everyday resistance, and queries how such a conception might impact the practice of music education for those in other marginalized spaces.

Keywords: *musicking, Palestine, identity, identity practice, hybridity, third space, everyday resistance*

O ur theoretical aim in this paper is to interrogate the potential for *musicking* — Christopher Small's (1989) conception of the musical act, which does not separate musical participation from the musical product — to open up space for the performance of cultural hybridity, defined by Homi Bhabha (2008) as a subversive practice of resistance to disrupt the symbolic systems that serve to dominate and control marginalized people. Our analysis goes beyond individual musical acts to the general practice of musicking in and through a specific physical and social setting: that of the Palestine Music Academy (pseudonym), an institution in the occupied Palestinian Territories (oPT).

The naming of this geo-political region suggests a particular constellation of collective identity, which is contested in contemporary Western society, particularly in the United States and the current government of the State of Israel. The diversity

of political, national, ethnic, and religious identities of people within this region adds to the complexity. We reflect on such complexity in the context of musicking:

- What does it mean for people to engage in a production of their own culture in territories occupied by external forces?
- What is it like to train, perform, and participate in music in locations where the security of everyday life is precarious and conflict is endemic?
- How might musicking become a symbolic and spatial locus for reclaiming a collective identity that has been silenced?

These are the questions that motivate and frame our thoughts as we examine the particular case.

We acknowledge that the naming of this region is fraught with political questions. Should we call it "Palestine," "the West Bank," or "the occupied Palestinian territories"? We have chosen to call the area "Palestine" and its people "Palestinians" because that is how this academy and its clientele refer to themselves and the places they inhabit. We will refer to this institution as The Palestine Music Academy (PMA). We will argue that the musickers construct, in their everyday practice, their own self-claims of Palestinian identity that resist the stereotypes and negative labeling imposed by external forces.

Background

This paper evolved out of on-and-off conversations between colleagues, as Carol proposed and carried out a preliminary field research project in this West Bank music academy. A music education scholar, Carol had visited this institution in 2010 as a part of a faculty exchange program. Having had little prior knowledge of the Palestinian reality beyond Western media coverage, her impression was that the "lively and creative music culture" (part of the PMA's stated mission) of the PMA enabled members of the often-marginalized Palestinian community to construct individual and collective identities through music despite frequent conflict and political dissent (Frierson-Campbell forthcoming). In many ways their situation reminded her of the experiences of people from disenfranchised communities in the U.S., and this piqued her curiosity. Keumjae, a sociologist, was intrigued by the complex social relationships implied in Carol's descriptions of music-making in this

particular locality, and how those relationships seemed to challenge the symbolic order by which Palestinians are named in the West. Together, we saw theoretical challenges to be considered between the intersection of music-making and identity-making in this historical place.

Field Research

The project was conceived as an opportunity for preliminary data gathering in preparation for a longer residency. The field research for this project occurred during a 3-week period in June of 2014, when Carol split her time between living and assisting with music camps at the PMA's Village Activity Center (close to the city of Ramallah) and visiting other PMA sites. As a participant and observer (yet an outsider to the culture of the Academy and its constituents), her duties included assisting with two residential music camps for adolescents between the ages of 10 and 16. During the first, devoted to marching band and chamber music, she assisted with rehearsals as needed, while during the second, which featured classical Western chamber music as well as classical Arabic music instruction, she directed the camp choir and provided general assistance. (A third "outreach" camp was cancelled when, as a result of the kidnapping and murder of three Israeli settlers by Palestinian extremists near the city of Hebron, the Israeli government instituted a travel ban for all of Gaza, meaning that children from that territory would not be able to attend.) When the camps were not in session she lived in Bethlehem and traveled freely between PMA branches and outreach programs in Ramallah, Bethlehem, Nablus, Hebron, and Jericho.

While time constraints limited research interactions (particularly with families and young children), Carol was able to interview a cross-section of adults: one of the PMA's founders, a number of administrators and teachers, as well as current and former adult students. Two of the research participants were European; the others were Palestinian. One of the administrators made sure she had contact with PMA staff that was representative of a variety of Palestinians: West Bank-ers, Jerusalem-ites, and Arab Israelis. Some were directly involved with the camp, while others were involved with branch locations. Most in some way had been involved with the Palestine Youth Orchestra, one of the PMA's signature programs.

The primary methods of data gathering during this residency were interview and observation; interview data were the principal source of information for this article. Interviews were conducted in locations chosen by the participants, which varied from academy offices to restaurant lobbies to dorm rooms at the Village Activity Center. Two group interviews were held; the others were conducted one-on-one. Each semi-structured interview began with this request: "Tell me your story as a musician, and the role this Academy plays in your story." In addition, the interview sought information about how long and in what capacity the participant had been involved at the Ma'ahad (the Arabic word for institution, and an informal reference by "insiders" to the PMA), how they interpreted the Academy's role in the community, and where else they made music, with a final question again requesting a story "about something special" that happened as a result of participation in the Ma'ahad. Conversations were digitally recorded on an iPod and transcribed by hand. Completed transcripts were returned to participants for correction and a second approval. Data were analyzed thematically, using "constant comparative" procedures (Glaser and Strauss 1967). Of the interview narratives, the conversations detailed in the paper were chosen because they were most illustrative of the claims made here, as is a common practice in the qualitative analysis of interview data. We used quotes from all but one of the approved interviews, though perhaps some more extensively than others. This research process was reviewed and approved by the Institutional Review Board of the authors' university, and each research participant signed an informed consent form. Both pseudonyms and actual names are used in this article depending on the preference of individual research participants as stated in the informed consent forms. The PMA administration also reviewed and approved the research protocol but that institution did not have an official review process.

Frames of Thought

Musicking

In this paper, we use Christopher Small's (1998) conceptualization of "musicking" (with a "k" to suggest the totality of actions surrounding and supporting musical acts) as the theoretical basis for an examination of everyday musical practices and related narratives from people who are involved with the PMA. Small critiques the way

philosophers and music theorists long have objectified and narrowed the definition of music by solely emphasizing musical products, dissociated from the people involved in the process of creating and performing. This perspective also played into the notion of hierarchy in the presumed quality of music, Small adds, whereby Western classical music has been given a privileged status as the upper end of the quality rank (1998, 3–6). Perhaps most problematic for the purpose of our analysis, traditional scholarly approaches detach music from the social relationships in which it is produced, enjoyed, and transmitted. Instead, Small's broader conception does not separate the acts of musical participants from the musical product.

"To music," according to Small, is "to take part, in any capacity, in a musical performance, whether by performing, by listening, by rehearsing or practicing, by providing material for performance (what is called composing), or by dancing" (9). The core of his definition is this: "Music is not a thing at all but an activity, something that people do" (2). Small's concept acknowledges the enactment of music as a *social reality,* which "establishes in the place where it is happening as a set of relationships," (Small 1998, 13) and it is through those relationships that musicking is given meaning. Borrowing his concept, we consider the practices of music as a collection of actions and practices, instead of simply artifacts. As such, we believe Small's conceptualization of musicking captures the imaginative, transcending, empowering, and transformative power that musickers often experience. A multitude of agents — not just the performers — are involved in this social process: the composers and writers, performers, audience, DJs; in fact, anyone for whom musicking is part of their everyday life, whether singing while cooking, or listening to iPods while running. Thus, music is much more diffused and ubiquitous than what is performed in concert halls and conservatories; musicking in fact is one of the most common human activities that give varied meaning to different groups of people in their everyday lives.

In short, the concept of musicking highlights musical practices, or music as what we *do*. Looking at musicking at PMA as something people do allows us to pay attention to the ways in which people connect with each other and form relationships through the practice of music, in the process exploring, affirming, and celebrating the meanings of their individual identities as musicians and Palestinians.

Frierson-Campbell, Carol, and Keumje Park. 2016. "I want to learn that": Musicking, identity, and resistance in a Palestinian music academy. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 15 (2): 73–100. act.maydaygroup.org/articles/FriersonCampbellPark15_2.pdf

Sociological theories of identity provide a few valuable insights to further illuminate these dynamics.

Identity, Performance, and Ritual

There is an interesting parallel between the conceptualization of musicking as something we *do* (rather than music as something that *is*) and the way sociologists have come to understand the idea of "identity." The term "identity" has been widely debated in various scholarly and political fields in the past few decades. This is in part due to the many forms of rights claims and political mobilization in the contemporary world that are based on identities (e.g., gay rights movement, feminist movement). But the term "identity" has also emerged in the scholarly dialogues as a key analytic concept relevant to various types of social practices (Brubaker and Cooper 2000). A persistent tension that has framed the debates on identity as an analytic category (Gaztambide-Fernández 2006) is probably the contrast between identity as a result of internal and individual experiences (as often considered in psychology) and the sociological view of identity as reflecting interactive and situational social process (e.g., Goffman 1959; Mead 1934). The former approach assumes some sense of internal anchor, or core existence inside the individual, which differentiates the self from others, and emphasizes the reactions of this core existence to the outside social environments (e.g., Erikson [1959] 1980). This approach is not necessarily limited to the idea of coherent self-concept in the psychological sense, but includes the assumption of some fundamentally shared characteristics on which group solidarity is grounded. Many studies of collective identity (for example, ethnic identity, nationalism, race, and gender) suggest that core qualities (or "essences" as some would call them), are the key to group formation among those who share those common characteristics (See Fuss 1989 for a review of the literature on this "essentialist" approach).

On the other hand, the tradition focusing on the interactive and situational aspects of identity has paid attention to the process by which identities — individual as well as collective — are socially constructed. From Mead's socialization theory to postmodern theories of deconstruction, this latter approach claims identity as something that is neither coherent nor stable; instead, identity is viewed as multiple

processes of construction and negotiation (Cerulo 1997). For example, Erving Goffman's dramaturgical theory conceptualized identity as performance (Goffman 1959; also Garfinkel 1967). He argued that identity exists only as it is presented, displayed, and indeed performed, to others. Goffman's (1959) main insight was not that we present what already internally exists as a coherent identity, but rather, "the very structure of the self can be seen in terms of how we arrange for such performances" (252). In Goffman's conceptualization, it is the performance that brings identity into being.

In a separate theoretical development, a proliferation of poststructural and postmodern projects of "deconstructing" what had been assumed to be stable social structures, including identity (Brubaker and Cooper 2000), paralleled Goffmanian approaches in the second half of the 20th Century. "Deconstruction," which originated from postmodern theorist Jacque Derrida's usage ([1967] 1998), generally refers to critical efforts to challenge and destabilize existing symbolic systems by examining, taking apart, and questioning the very structures that form the status-quo. The underlying premise of deconstruction is that power relations are socially and culturally constructed. Therefore, by undoing the social construction, it is possible to de-stabilize oppressive systems and open up space for questioning and changing such systems. Following Derrida's inspiration, deconstructionist scholarship in general aims to expose and undo embedded power relations within the status-quo, largely focusing on existing symbolic systems of meaning which support and naturalize the power relations.

In contemporary poststructuralist and postmodern theories, identities, once thought of as tangible and persistent "bonds" among in-group members (such as race, gender, sexuality), have become prime subjects of deconstructionist analyses. Recent identity theories in this tradition (e.g., Butler 1993; Hall and Gilroy 1997) have particularly focused on de-stabilizing and de-naturalizing such identity categories by analyzing processes and patterns of speech, action, and other symbolic practices of meaning-making. Conceptualized as "discursive practices" by French social theorist Michel Foucault (1972), these habits create cultural meanings about various identities (e.g., race, class, gender, national identity), and it is through repeated instances of these routine practices that boundaries of collective identity are

produced and objectified. By exposing the process of the social construction of identities, deconstructionist identity theorists also brought into light the ways in which identity categories have been challenged and transformed as a part of the broader power dynamics of society (Brubaker and Cooper 2000). In other words, they uncovered that symbolic practices and meaning systems often are built on underlying contrasts of things that are unequal, a point which we will turn to later. Thus, the symbolic and discursive practices we *do* are critical to identity formation and the power relations between identity groups.

Of the many everyday practices that form the discursive fields of identity practices, rituals are of particular importance. Since Emile Durkheim's insights into religious rituals and group consciousness ([1912] 1995), sociologists and anthropologists have shown particular appreciation for rituals in constructing and strengthening collective identity. Durkheim argued that a key function of religious and cultural rituals is to strengthen beliefs and values that are central to a group. Thus, in Durkheim's theory, rituals are central to creating the sense of belonging that affirms individual *experiences* of being connected to a group. Similarly, Erving Goffman's (1961) work on so-called "total institutions" (e.g., prisons, military, psychiatric wards) also emphasizes the role of routine and repeated collective practices as a way to encourage individuals to separate from their individuality and adhere to the collect identity. As such, repeated rituals are instrumental for producing and reproducing the symbolic structure that forms the narratives about group identity (Gaztambide-Fernández 2006). It is no coincidence that rituals most often deploy the symbolic power of the arts (e.g., stories, music, dance, images) to construct discourses of collective identity.

Not surprisingly, Small connects musicking with rituals. He argues that musicking is a way of performing social relationships (1998). Thus, as a form of everyday ritual, musicking has an important function for identity:

> . . . people articulate their concepts of how the relationships of their world are structured, and thus of how humans ought to relate to one another. Such ideas held in common about how people ought to relate to one another, of course, define a community, so rituals are used both as an act of affirmation of community ("This is who we are"), as an act of exploration (to try on identities to see who we think we are), and as an act of celebration (to rejoice in the knowledge of an identity not only possessed but also shared with others). (95)

As we examine our data about PMA, the subversive potential of musicking and its implication for collective identity formation in Palestine identity become the locus of our analysis.

Musicking, Identity Practice, and Resistance
Thinking of identities in the context of Palestine requires a consideration of historicity. It is not our goal to engage in discussions of geopolitical history here; however, there is a point to be made about how the geopolitical dynamics of the 20th century have shaped the drawing of ethnic, national, and cultural boundaries. Moreover, the continuing history of conflicts has constructed a discourse of contentious opposition between Israeli (perceived as Jewish) and Palestinian (perceived as Arab) identities. Often forgotten is the fact that the geographical region of Palestine had been populated by heterogeneous groups of people with different cultural and religious traditions through much of the long history of the region. The boundaries of what is now called Palestine had been also broader and not as clearly demarcated as they became in post-1948 history (Marshall 1995). After World War II, however, a series of significant political processes gave a new and charged meaning to the idea of territories within the region. Those significant events include, but are not limited to, the 1947 United Nations' partition plan, the establishment of the State of Israel, the War of 1948, the War of 1967, and more recently the Oslo Accord of 1993. Also important to many of the research participants are the conflicts known as the First Intifada (1987-1993) and Second Intifada (2000-2005).

Perhaps one of the enduring consequences of all these events, and the many conflicts and negotiations between them, is a heightened sense of territory and a symbolic separation between Israel and Palestine in the narrower sense. Hence, the binary construction of Israeli-Jewish identity vs. Palestinian-Arab identity has become a prevailing antithesis in the region's history. As Hochberg (2006) commented, borrowing from Edward Said ([1979] 1992), these contested categories of identity have been further solidified by the collective history of loss and victimhood on both sides, which have been narrated and re-narrated in such ways to

affirm and strengthen the imperative of strong nationalist identities and militant forces to support them. In time, the term "Palestine," once a loosely defined regional designation with a lot of internal diversity has come to denote what is not Israeli-Jewish, and vice versa. Scholars would argue that these two categories, now constructed as alterity, "cannot be easily identified but in relation to each other" (Hochberg 2006, 59). Edward Said writes, "The more intense the modern struggles for identity, the more attention is paid by the Arab or the Jew to his [sic] chosen opponent, or partner. Each is the other" (1974, 3).

The military and economic control of the Arab-Palestinian concentrated areas of the West Bank by the state of Israel since 1967 has added the dimension of a colonial occupation to this history (Massad 2005; Said 1974). From the Palestinian point of view, life is experienced as occupation and oppression by external force, as they witness limitations, disempowerment, and denial of rights on a daily basis. Hence, we view that the ways in which Palestinian identity and the (Western) Jewish-Israeli identity are constructed as oppositional and unequal alterity is analogous to the way postcolonial theorists (e.g., Fanon 1967) theorized about the second-rate citizen statuses of colonized groups in other instances of forced occupation in human history. Furthermore, the narratives of terrorism and militancy, and the construction of Islam as monolithically "outmoded" and "dangerous" are persistent discourses in much of the Western world, which arguably continues to justify and support colonial controls over Palestinians both symbolically and politically. For instance, Western narratives have rarely differentiated all Arabs from dangerous fundamentalist groups, and routinely portray Islam as a monolithic group who are dangerous, anti-West, and perhaps anti-modernization (Said 1979, 27).

To transgress such discursive construction is to resist the casting of Palestine as 1) a homogenous collectivity, 2) violent and threatening, and 3) anti-West. In such a context, resisting the dominant colonial narratives on the Palestinians requires subversive symbolic practices that deconstruct the stigmatized labeling from outside, and reconstruct the Palestinian collective identity from inside. Attempts by the colonized to re-articulate their authentic identity from within can expose the cultural discourse of asymmetry and the built-in denunciation which casts them as "other" — second rate citizens, marked, and different. Challenging this binary

symbolic/cultural system can open up a subversive cleavage that Homi Bhabha (1994) calls "the third space." Since this third space is created by critical *practices,* it is also called "third space of enunciation" (Bhabha 1994, 54) referring to the simultaneity of the action and the effect.

In social theories, socially constructed epistemological binary systems that place the Self and the Other into unequal categories (e.g., man and woman, adult and minor, civilization and nature, etc.) are recognized as important pillars of cultural domination. Sociologist Pierre Bourdieu (1991, 229–50) argues that dominant groups have the ability to control symbolic structures and thereby legitimate and naturalize the stratified order between oppositional categories. According to Bhabha, the practice of hybridity in the third space of enunciation allows for the deconstruction of such binary hierarchies. Bhabha (1994) conceptualizes hybridity as a deliberately transgressive practice that displaces the epistemological dichotomy between the Self and the Other, and the "third space" as the symbolic space in which various forms of "hybridity" are enacted. In such a context, hybridity is an on-going process of resistance that is "interruptive, interrogative, and enunciative" (103). Thus, practices of hybridity deconstruct and reconstruct symbolic structures of difference with the purpose of intervening and disrupting the forces that homogenize and essentialize cultures and identities. In this case, hybridity performed within the third space of enunciation enables the interrogation and de-naturalization of the cultural assumption of Arab-and-Israeli opposition and uncovers hidden ambivalence and in-between meanings in the seemingly irreconcilable binary. In our analysis of PMA below, we will explore how musicking, hybridity of various music traditions, and empowering identities intersect.

Musicking in the Third Space

Musicking in Place

It was a musical response of resistance to a curfew during the First Intifada in the late 1980's that inspired Mohamed, a 30-year old woodwind teacher at the PMA and a well-known performer of classical and Arabic music, to a life as a musician. This was a time when curfews were in place, and as a young child he was not allowed to go outside because it was dangerous:

> Because soldiers were all around, we were like — many people had been killed, tear gas, tires fired, stones in the street, and there were always soldiers walking the street, with their weapons . . . so it was dangerous. So a natural human reaction from my father and my mother, "Do not go out." Of course, I'm a child. "Do not play in the neighborhood, no, no, no."

But he had a neighbor who would regularly defy the night-time curfew by playing the *nay* — the Arabic flute — on his rooftop, risking his life:

> The nay, in the evening, it was just scotching across, I mean against the wall. And I just listened through the window. Because also you should not appear your head from the window, it's dangerous. Anyway, that guy was, didn't care, he was going on his roof playing, and I was listening. And it just, you know, took me deeply. Like, this sound was really affecting me a lot. So I said "I want to learn that."

Impressed by this man's defiant musicking, Mohamed began to try out instruments, *any* musical instruments available to him, and aspire to be a musician.

> . . . once my uncle brought a keyboard, an electric keyboard, and he left it home, and then he went with my father and I start playing on it. It felt really good. I think I played for one hour and a half, and I remember it was like 5 minutes. I was like 6 years old . . . and I remember it. Like, I was really happy. I was just improvising, I don't know what I was doing.

> And when I was listening to songs, I was really feeling good and just trying to imitate the instruments and play. And I really wanted that so bad. And that's because I was a very shy person when I was a kid, and I wasn't sure of myself, I was sensitive, I was crying a lot, and then I remember that (laughs), so by music, it actually starts all that. It was just taking me.

> And then in the school, we learned the flute, the recorder flute. And I was very happy. I remember I took this recorder flute and was running home. And I just started playing on it and I got three songs just by ear. Moving my fingers and following the tones. So it was really natural for me, it was like, "I know this. I need to do this." In a way, to express myself . . .

Small emphasizes that musicking provides opportunities to explore identity by cultivating social relationships as a way to find "who we think we are." As such, musicking provides opportunities for self-discovery and, for Mohamed and others, self-exploration of Palestinian identity. "The consolidation of Palestinian identity and the education of future generations" is a part of the stated mission of the PMA. Founded initially as the National Academy of Music under the umbrella of a Palestinian University, the PMA is not housed in a single location, but in metropolitan areas throughout the oPT. The initial location was established in 1993,

in a large cosmopolitan West Bank city. Other branches followed in other cities in the oPT.

The PMA's educational programs reflect this vision. As of this writing, more than 800 students are part of the "academic program" across the five branches, where they study either an Arabic or Western instrument, participate in Arabic, Western, or mixed ensembles, and take classes in musicianship and Arabic percussion. Another 200 participate in choral or instrumental outreach programs in small villages and refugee camps.

Mohamed's musical story intersects with the opening of the PMA in Bethlehem, near his home village, as well as with the debut of the PYO and PNO. Despite the fact that an uprising kept him from being allowed to register before the stated deadline, his determination to become a musician led him to "inscribe himself" (register) upon the opening of the Bethlehem branch:

> The academy came in 1997. At that time I went, and I inscribed, and they didn't accept me because it was past the deadline, and the director inside heard me, and he said, "Come here. Where's your father, where's your mother?" and I said "nobody's with me," and I came to here and inscribed myself. And he gave me the application, he called my dad, and they gave me a scholarship from the first time. My dad (chuckles) didn't tell me that I had a scholarship; he made me feel like he had paid so I'd take it seriously but it was serious for me (laughs).

Mohamed's coming-of-age process as musician also was an exploration of his Palestinian identity:

> I saw the violin teacher, then I chose the saxophone, then two months later my teacher convinced me to play clarinet. And this is the start. And then it started this way and I started learning, little by little. And just . . . feeling more like this is what I want to be. I feel good. And I started expressing myself more, and saying everything I can say in the society. For political reasons, and . . . When I play, everybody listens and nobody interrupts me. Nobody is against with what I'm saying. Musically, maybe, but I can express myself! I mean, this is me.

The PMA supports a series of training orchestras as well as two "flagship" Western orchestras (Our Approach, n. d.), which bring together Palestinians from inside the oPT, Israeli controlled territories, and the world-wide diaspora. Such "ensemble work is a cornerstone pedagogical tool as well as a means of catalyzing symbols of national unity and sovereignty" (Belkind 2014, 99). The Palestine Youth Orchestra (PYO), established in 2004, brings together "young Palestinian musicians from around the world in a high-quality orchestral ensemble" (Palestine Youth

Orchestra 2015). Approximately 80 musicians between the ages of 15 and 25 come together each summer for a one-week residency followed by an international concert tour. The Palestine National Orchestra (PNO) debuted on New Year's Eve, 2010. Currently a festival chamber orchestra, it is made up of professional Palestinian musicians and international musicians (often current or former teachers) who have connections to Palestine (Palestine National Orchestra n.d.).

We note here that to produce and participate in classical (Western) music in this situation is to confront and be confronted by political disenfranchisement and cultural displacement, to challenge "the power relation which constitutes the space of position" (Bourdieu 1993, 32). In such spaces of duality, suggests Bhabha (1994), cultural hybridity may become "an on-going process of resistance" that is "interruptive, interrogative, and enunciative" (103), deconstructing and reconstructing symbolic structures of difference with the purpose of disrupting the forces that homogenize and essentialize cultures and identities. We argue that cultural hybridity in this sense is not a fixed entity but a process and practice, transgressing boundaries between groups, cognitive categories, and cultural traditions. Thus, we argue that hybridity has a dimension of motion and praxis, and can be called "doing" just as music and identity are of our doing. As such, we locate musicking at PMA within the practice of hybridity with the connotation of agency. Thus, PNO and PYO in particular "both literally and symbolically serve to diffuse the isolation of Palestinian subjectivities and communities imposed by the conditions of dispersal, exile and occupation," while forming "a basis for national cultural infrastructure" (Belkind 2014, 100).

Outsiders often imagine Palestinians as a homogenous group who are Arab, Muslim, and all similarly poor. However, Palestinians are diverse internally, and include a diasporic population widely dispersed around the world, an outcome of their displacement after 1948. As such, members of PYO are gathered from all around the world even speaking different languages. Thus, there is a special affirmation of common Palestinian identity when musicking binds this heterogeneous group of youths into an emerging group consciousness. As Rachel (PMA music teacher and former manager of the PYO) observed about the 2008 tour:

> There were Palestinians from Syria, here, Jordan, Latin American, who didn't know how each other lived. . . . But then bonds started to form . . .

it was really something extraordinary to see them get together and work as a team.

For Mohamed and several other students from the PMA, participation in the youth orchestra was a formative experience.

> Mohamed: In 2004 I had my first playing with the PYO and it was . . . that was the thunderstruck that just shocked me like (mimics "poof") like that. Sitting there behind, with the clarinetist, and I was the fourth, and just listening to all this power coming out, with those sounds, it just . . . I was really frozen for like half an hour, not moving. And I was really like . . . this is heaven. This is unbelievable. So I fell in love with the classical music through the orchestra. It was (wow!) all those sounds (motions with hands: whoo, whoo, whoo) together. It's like in the middle of the ocean, and actually you can breathe inside, but you can see the life in the ocean, all around the different colors. It was just a magical moment.

Mohamed's unique Palestinian-musician identity is fluidly expressed in his versatility with Western music, Arab music, and the hybrid of the two. He stated in his interview that the way music connected him to "this land," both in a physical and symbolic sense, was at the center of his identification as Palestinian. Simply put, it appears that for this musician, being Palestinian is explored in his musicking, and his musicking is the affirmation and celebration of his being Palestinian. Mohamed considers resistance as *connecting* to the people of Palestine through his musicking:

> Mohamed: The music is a way to understand . . . your identity. To resist by it. Because it means something when you play. You have a communication. When you play to the people, you give a message. *Myself, personally I learned through the music, not necessarily the academy only, that I belong to this land, and I stress this, and I have this spiritual link, which is a phantom for some people.* But for me, it's like a spiritual nurturing thing, a circle between me and this land that I can understand it more, and make others to understand it. (Italics are our emphasis)

The Politics of Place

To mobilize Palestinian identity through everyday musicking is not to create a reified and essentialized image of "the Palestinian culture," nor is it an attempt to use music as a political instrument. As our interview data show, the identity process embedded in the practices of music is rather diffused and ambivalent. One of the ways in which this is displayed is the transgressing of state imposed identity and spatial categories. Space is an appropriate metaphor and a critical concept to illuminate the politics of identity in Palestine and the way musicking is used to resist it. In the observational

notes and interviews, it became clear that the politics of geography people in PMA inhabit is much more than physical buildings and geographical locations.

Indeed, one of the things that reminds outsiders of the conflict and occupation in this place is the geographical confinements enforced by the checkpoints and travel regulations. As is well known, Palestinians carry color-coded ID cards that indicate what people are allowed to do and where they can go based on government imposed identities. As described in an interview with Carol, Sahar (an amateur violinist from the PYO and former student from the PMA, now employed by the Bethlehem municipality) and Matteo (a European administrator and violin teacher from the PMA whose duties included working with the PYO), the intricate system is complex, demeaning, and often irrational. This conversation took place shortly after the kidnapping described earlier, and was partly in response to the mobility restrictions that were imposed as a result.

> Sahar: There . . . so whenever there are problems, they start checking on it. When there are no problems, nothing is checked. So now, when there are problems, what they did was that they checked each car, to see your ID. So . . . in our ID's, we have which city you are from. Bethlehem, Hebron, Ramallah, whatever.
>
> Carol: What does that mean?
>
> Sahar: Now I'll tell you what that means. So if they see Bethlehem, okay, pass. If they see Hebron, no, go back. Because of what happened.
>
> Carol: And they make you go back? They literally make you turn around and go home?
>
> Sahar: Yeah! That's normal thing. To turn back and go home? It's normal.
>
> Sahar: Have you seen an ID? A Palestinian . . . Do you want a 101 occupation lesson?
>
> Carol: Absolutely. (Laughs) I was walking today, thinking I can't keep track of which license plate is which. And then I realized it's because I don't have to. It doesn't matter for me. I'm okay either way.
>
> Sahar: The yellow one, you can come here.
>
> Carol: The yellow one is everywhere?
>
> Matteo: The yellow one, cars can go anywhere.

Sahar: Yeah, it's Israeli. The white ones are only Palestinian.

Matteo: Yeah. But yellow plated cars cannot be driven by people with a green identity card.

Sahar: This is a green identity card.

Matteo: There is a color code which is amazing. (Chuckles)

Carol: What's the assumption? If you're born in X place, or Y place, or Z place, what difference does that make?

Sahar: Here's the difference. The people born in Jerusalem, and they have Arab origins, are always, always under the threat of being . . .

Matteo: Expelled.

Sahar: Yes, or having their Jerusalem ID taken from them. The Jerusalem ID is blue. But the numbers here [shows her ID] show that these are Arab...

Carol: These are Arab Israelis. Okay.

Sahar: Not Israeli. They are not even Israelis. Not Arab Israelis. Not Israelis. They are Jerusalem-ites.

Matteo: Yeah so they don't have an Israeli passport.

Carol: So they're not Palestinian, they're not . . .

Sahar and Matteo together: They are Palestinian . . .

Sahar: without Palestinian passport.

Matteo: I mean, you have Palestinians, like, who are in Haifa and Nazareth and so on, who have an Israeli passport. They are Palestinians with the right to...

Sahar: They stayed in 1948 in their houses.

Matteo: Yeah. Then you have those who were in Jerusalem until 1967, meaning in Jordan. And then became, who came under Israeli occupation, but did not acquire the Israeli citizenship. Just what they call a permanent resident permit.

Sahar: Temporary.

Matteo: No, I think it's called permanent, but it has nothing of permanent and they can revoke it whenever they want to.

Sahar: Yeah, they now have an expiry date on their ID.

Matteo: Yeah, green ID cards. Holders. Cannot drive yellow plated cars. Not even here. Not even in Bethlehem or Ramallah.

Sahar: Yes. Not allowed to work in Israel. Not allowed to be in a car with someone who doesn't have a permit in Israel. If I get caught with someone who doesn't have a permit…

Matteo: You're in a lot of trouble.

Sahar: Yeah, I will get a black dot. And I will not get a permit. I'm not allowed to do many things.

Carol: How long does a black dot last?

Sahar: It's forever . . .

As it is clear in these dialogues, the Israeli government maintains complex identification categories among Palestinians, which shape their lives on a daily basis. This is a sophisticated system of surveillance and control over not only the geographical territories — the place — but also different categories of occupied people. Thus, musicking in Palestine, whether planning a performance at a particular location, holding music camps, or even scheduling a music lesson, requires mobilizing groups of people with different access to places. Participation in such activities "serve[s] to reterritorialize geographic and social fragmentation into a continuous Palestinian cultural space" (Belkind 2014, 100). Needless to say, knowledge of the system and "street-smart" skills to go around and negotiate the spatial limitations are a routine part of and an embedded meaning in everyday musicking.

Affirming and Celebrating Palestinian Identity
One of the ways in which musicking becomes a significant moment of affirmation and celebration of Palestinian identity is when the PYO or PNO performs for an audience outside the oPT. In Carol's interviews with students, she encountered narratives about an awakening to the significance of Palestinian identity as a part of their musicking experiences. For example, through performances by the Palestinian Youth Orchestra in which many PMA students participate, the musicians and

audience can experience the feeling of "collective conscience," an emotional bond with the group (Durkheim [1912] 1995). In this excerpt from an interview, Sama (a high school aged member of the Palestinian Youth Orchestra), described to her grandmother Rima (a composer and founder of the academy) how she was surprised during a concert in Genoa, Italy by an unexpected moment of affirmation that she experienced through musicking:

> Sama: . . . when we finished, everybody was clapping, and we looked to the right, and a group of five people, they suddenly hold up the Palestinian flag. It was just like, whoa! Goose bumps all over.

> Rima: How did you feel when you saw that?

> Sama: It was really . . . like, it was a surprise. But it was a nice surprise.

> Rima: Yes, that happened in the Proms[1] also.

> Sama: Oh, that's right. Suddenly these people were hoisting the Palestinian flag and. . . . Yeah . . . it was weird.

> Carol: It was weird?

> Sama: I mean like a good weird.

> Rima: The word "weird" is like . . . we are saying "nice."

> Sama: No, not really. It can have many meanings.

> Rima: No actually, you know it's interesting, speaking of the Palestinian flag. To them [the youth] it stopped being such a novelty. This generation after Oslo. Because before Oslo, when you held a Palestinian flag, I mean, you could be shot for it.

As Sama's accounts illustrate, these instances of musicking allow students to encounter a discursive construction of Palestinian nationality, not only asserted to the outside world but also to students themselves. These are significant symbolic moments in which the young Palestinian musickers witness an emerging group consciousness, which is then physically experienced ("Goose bumps all over") and vividly engraved in their memories.

Later in the interview, Sama described a different kind of surprise, when after an outdoor concert on the same tour, she encountered a man whose assumptions about

Palestinian musicians were limited to either collaborative performances with Israelis or the carrying of an explicit political message.

> Sama: It was a good concert. There were bugs all over the music sheets — they were huge. Couldn't see the notes. Oh, my God! But after that, I remember this man came up to me. He was like: Oh, so you are playing with Israelis? I'm like: No, no, no. We're the Palestine Youth Orchestra. He's like: Oh, I see. And what's your message? I'm just like: Oh, why did I get this person? So I just told him, you know, that we're Palestinians and we're playing for music. We don't have any political message. *And that kind of opened up my eyes to . . . what the title kind of sends out, or what it advocates, you know?* So it was just like, okay, an eye-opener to that. What we say about the orchestra and what not. Yeah. It really . . . it really was one of these amazing experiences, like I remember the first concert, the first real concert . . . (Italics are our emphasis).

Sama's reflections allow us to glimpse the ways in which musical performances externalized moments of national identity of which the young students may not have been explicitly aware in their everyday lives. We should note here, as did Rima in the interview, that this young student's apparent obliviousness to her Palestinian identity in her everyday life is probably a "privilege" the post-Oslo generation can enjoy. Today's Palestinian youth can take for granted their national identity more so than people of Rima's generation for whom this was risky, contested, and fought for.

Despite Sama's insistence that the PYO was "playing for music," she acknowledged that the orchestra did send out a message:

> Carol: Is there anything uniquely Palestinian for you about the Academy?

> Sama: Um, I'm not sure. I guess, the thing that is most unique is um, maybe the message we send out, like the Palestine Youth Orchestra. . . . yeah, the PMA orchestra. *There are little things* that are always indicating that this is Palestine and we're Palestinian. Or, for example, when we go out on stage, we usually have a *keffiyeh*. So it's just like, a message, and how we send it.

> Carol: So it's a kind of a way to send the message?

> Sama: I guess so, yeah. I mean, *I don't think we're . . . we're not really being patriotic, like "oh, my God, Palestine." But we're definitely sending out a message that we're Palestinians and all of that.*

> Rima: You must have felt this especially in London, when you came on stage how they applauded you, my God. It was overwhelming.

> Sama: (small laugh) I know. It was overwhelming. No, it wasn't that overwhelming. It felt like we were going out to practice. (motioning) "Come on, let's do this again."

Frierson-Campbell, Carol, and Keumje Park. 2016. "I want to learn that": Musicking, identity, and resistance in a Palestinian music academy. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 15 (2): 73–100. act.maydaygroup.org/articles/FriersonCampbellPark15_2.pdf

To her grandmother, the message included highlighting Palestinian composers:

> Rima: But also you forgot to tell her about the music that you were performing. You have been trying to highlight also some Palestinian musicians. Remember, John Bisharat, Ahmad al Khatib and Issa Boulos. . . .
>
> Sama: Oh, *I guess I never thought of it that way. Its just music we have to play.* [Rima chuckles] Not always the easiest or the most familiar." (Italics are our emphasis)

As we can see, claims of collective Palestinian identity cannot be taken for granted. This is an identity that had long been either forced into silence or into labels that are "overdetermined from without" (Fanon 1967, 87) by external forces. For example, at least until the 1993 Oslo Accord, the display of Palestinian collectivity using any symbolic means had been retaliated against routinely, as it was considered a dangerous and covert political action. Rima said as much in the interview.

During Carol's stay at PMA, the ways in which music, children, classes, and everyday interactions construct the normalcy of everyday life struck as a stark contrast to the stories of checkpoints, travel bans, and violence, which comprise most of the headlines about Palestine in Western newspapers. In her field journal, she instructed herself to "make note of what's 'normal'":

> . . . the children simply running and playing at the Ramallah branch of the Academy and at the camp, etc. It strikes me that perhaps "normal" is what we take for granted, and perhaps one of the goals of the Palestinian parents is that it will be possible for their children to take their safety and their identity as Palestinians for granted. So I suspect that creating a sense of "normal" is itself political in a place where there are people that don't want you to exist. It's so like a parallel universe here. Well-built and designed music conservatories with happy successful children running gleefully through the halls and playing music at levels that would rival those anywhere are not the vision of Palestine my world wants me to have . . . (Memo, June 10, 2014)

Reflecting on the experience after returning home, Carol noted the privilege of being able to take the right to move freely for granted:

> Even though I've been there, I cannot imagine my comings and goings, where and whether I'm allowed to go, and sometimes my physical safety being controlled on a daily basis by an ID that tells where I'm from. I hope it was clear in my conversation [with Sahar and Matteo] that I realized how privileged I was not to have to keep track of ID's . . . as opposed to most Palestinians for whom it is a de-humanizing part of daily life. (Memo, September 8, 2014)

While Carol could not imagine maintaining seemingly routine everyday practices against such odds, Rachel's interview suggested that it was "wanting what other people in the world have" that motivated such acts:

> The fact that it's difficult is what keeps people going. Because it's Israel trying to hold it back. We want to have what other people in the world have. The more difficult, the more we dig in our heels.

As Rachel implies, building a sense of normalcy within the widespread restrictions of everyday life sometimes means simply surviving the trying situations on a daily basis. During other times, being "normal" is expressed by freeing their musicking from political purposes. De-politicizing their everyday musicking is one way that people at this site affirm and celebrate their rights to exist like everyone else in the outside world. We interpret that constructing a sense of normalcy by way of mundane actions, such as those involved in musicking, is what Scott (1989) calls "everyday resistance," a tactical and ambiguous form of resistance from within using the means and tools embedded in everyday life. It is not by way of making political music, but rather by detaching it from political propaganda that musicking actually becomes a form of everyday resistance.

Thus, the musicking at PMA was not necessarily "politicized" music, nor even confined to what is presumably "Palestinian music" that will strengthen "traditional" Arab culture. Rather, PMA students explored musicking diversely, from European classical music to classical Arab music, and any forms of hybridity music. Rachel explained:

> PMA has "opened up musical space" by combining the two styles. Sometimes this leads to unique musical events . . . or not. But "many come through the PMA and see music as something and Palestine as something else." A lot of people don't want the "burden of Palestine" to be put on music. After all, what is Palestinian music? Palestinian folklore can be considered as part of the folklore of greater Syria and shares much with that of the modern states of Lebanon and Syria. So . . . is classical Arabic music Palestinian? You can't put these things in boxes, but you can talk about music in Palestinian society. Some relate it to politics, others do not.

While most of the people interviewed at PMA did not explicitly tie musicking to political resistance, a common message was that musicking allowed them to *claim their identities in their own ways*. We would therefore argue that, as young Palestinian musickers freely described who they are and how they feel about being a

music students in Palestine, they empowered themselves to resist, in fact to dismiss, the misconstrued, homogenizing, and stigmatizing labels the dominant narratives of Western politics often associate with them: "terrorists" "militants," or "refugees." Instead, what emerged in the narrative data were their identities as everyday people, people of diversity, people in search of a physical locus for the family, subsistence, and culture like everyone else. They were claiming that being Palestinian is no different from being everyday people in other places.

Conclusions

The Palestinian identity the musicians of the PMA express through musicking is that of everyday people, of incredible diversity, of cosmopolitan aspiration, invoking a recognition of the physical locus of their family, subsistence, and culture. They are claiming that being Palestinian is no different from being everyday people in other places — but precisely because they cannot assume the taken-for-granted continuity of mundane everyday routine in their lives, their self-proclamation of identity is constantly displaced in a paradoxical discourse of universality and particularity. Their particular identity as Palestinians must therefore be claimed until they can take it for granted as a fact of life.

Our goal in this paper was to show instances of "the third space of enunciation" in music education in Palestine based on pilot research at the PMA. From our perspective, musicking at the PMA opens up such space in a number of different ways. First, as our discussions have shown, Palestinian musickers affirm, explore, and celebrate their Palestinian identity in their practice of music. While most musickers do not aim at overt political goals, they are often surprised when the relationships and symbols that embody Palestinian collectivity are instantiated as result of their musicking. Through those instances, a heterogeneous group of Palestinian youth found connections with one another, and with the imagined collectivity of Palestinians around the world. Second, we have shown how, through musicking, participants created a social space for performing what we call "the political of the non-political," which is expressed in resilience, aspiration, and imagining a future for themselves and their children. Third, the lived realities of these PMA musickers constantly expose the incongruity of geographical, religious,

Frierson-Campbell, Carol, and Keumje Park. 2016. "I want to learn that": Musicking, identity, and resistance in a Palestinian music academy. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 15 (2): 73–100. act.maydaygroup.org/articles/FriersonCampbellPark15_2.pdf

ethnic, and national boundaries within the historical context of Palestine today. While the Israeli-imposed identification categories delineate the geographies of everyday life and place challenging hurdles to everyday musicking, Palestinian musickers at the PMA face those obstacles with resilience and even humor, and, in the process, expose the irrationality of the system. By revealing ambiguity and ambivalence embedded in the symbolic and political borders, practices of musicking can challenge the dominant political discourses that displace people of Palestine into stereotyped labels of terrorists and victims. Thus, we find that the third space in this context is not about strengthening ideological and territorial Palestinian nationalist identity per se, but about resisting the homogenizing labeling, rearticulating diverse styles of Palestinian culture, and legitimating their lived experiences.

This preliminary examination of the experience of musicking in and around the PMA has implications not only for the continued study of interactions with that organization, but also for the practices of music teachers and learners in general, and particularly in contexts where "othering" is a reality, whether for perceived ethnic, political, religious, economic, sexual, or a combination of differences. For teachers and for learners, whether in schools, conservatories, garage bands or home studios, what might it mean for music education to be more than indoctrination to (canonical) music? How can canonical traditions be challenged toward the "third space of enunciation," both for and by marginalized students, individually and in community?

On that note, we would like to close by contemplating how two powerful images allow us to glimpse such interstice. One is the image of the roof-top nay player who inspired our participant Mohamed, as discussed earlier in this article. Now a composer, multi-instrumentalist, and music educator, Mohamed had been moved by a neighbor who would regularly defy the night-time curfew by playing the nay — the Arabic flute — on his roof top, literally risking his life. But, as Mohamed stated, "that guy didn't care." Whether the nay player was politically motivated or not is out of our concern. But the powerful message this image sends is the agency of everyday individuals who quietly transgress control and oppression by way of musicking, which is neither violent nor politically conspicuous.

The second image is that of Small's "solitary flute player," a lone herdsman who plays "his flute as he guards his flock in the African night" (Small 1998, 201). Small asks readers what is social about this lone musician, and then answers himself: "Even the solitary herdsman playing only for himself is already part of a complex set of relationships" (202). This solitary herdsman's musicking is probably simply who he is and what he does each night as he guards his animals, but the image embodies the inherently social and routinized nature of musicking and self-identity.

Likewise, the young Palestinian musickers who were surprised by their own enunciation of Palestinian identity illustrate the embeddedness of the particular social contexts in which their musicking and identity performances occur. The social contexts of musicking at PMA carry underlying precariousness and fragility. As we understand, the stability and continuity of everyday life can never be taken for granted in this place, which, to outsiders like the researcher from the U.S., is a difficult reality to come to terms with. Reading Small's reflections on the solitary flute player, right after returning home from the PMA trip in summer of 2014, Carol wrote in her field journal:

> This paragraph brings me to tears as I think about the musicking I saw in the West Bank and the many contradictions, known and not known (to me) that were and are part of the evolving musical tradition in Palestine. Writing now, after returning from the West Bank and seeing on television the incredible destruction wrought . . . on the people of Gaza (knowing that the U.S. media will show very little of what actually occurred), and imagining the suppressed rage of those committed to nonviolent resistance, whether because of true conviction or something else, gives a concreteness to the idea of music as resistance as paradox that I had not thought of until now. After all, isn't non-violent resistance itself a bit of a paradox?

Continuing, Small's reflection on the space created by the solitary shepherd-flutist is an apt conclusion to our discussion of the agency enabled by the third space enunciation of Palestinian musicking:

> As he plays, the flutist is bringing into existence a sonic space that is defined by the limit of audibility of his flute in each direction, upward toward the skies as well as outward on the earth around him, into which he is projecting himself. It is his own sonic territory, in which his ideas of relationships are valid. And because how we relate is who we are, he is in effect saying, to himself and to anyone who may be listening, *Here I am, and this is who I am* (Small 1998, 206, emphasis in the original).

References

Belkind, Nili. 2014. *Music in conflict: Palestine, Israel, and the politics of aesthetic production.* Ph. D. Diss., Columbia University.

Bhabha, Homi K. 1994. *The location of culture.* New York: Routledge.

———. 2008. In the cave of making: Thoughts on third space. In *Communicating in the third space*, edited by Karin Ikas & Gerhard Wagner, ix–xi. Florence, KY: Routledge.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1991. *Language and symbolic power.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

———. 1993. *The field of cultural production.* New York: Columbia University Press.

Brubaker, Rogers, and Frederick Cooper. 2000. Beyond "identity." *Theory and Society* 29: 1–47.

Butler, Judith. 1993. *Bodies that matter.* London and New York: Routledge.

Cerulo, Karen A. 1997. Identity construction. *Annual Review of Sociology* 23: 385–409.

Derrida, Jacques. (1967) 1998. *On gramatology.* Translated by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Durkheim, Emile. (1912) 1995. *The elementary forms of religious life.* Translated by Karen Fields. New York: The Free Press.

Erikson, Eric H. (1959) 1980. *Identity and the life cycle.* New York and London: W.W. Norton and Company.

Fanon, Frantz. 1967. *Black skin, white mask.* New York: Grove Press.

Foucault, Michel. 1972. *The archeology of knowledge.* New York: Pantheon Books.

Frierson-Campbell, C. (forthcoming). Musicking in a "third place": Reflections after visiting a Palestinian community conservatory. *2014 Proceedings of the Community Music Action Commission Meeting*, International Society for Music Education.

Fuss, Diana. 1989. *Essentially speaking: Feminism, nature, and difference.* New York: Routledge.

Garfinkel, Harold. 1967. *Studies in Ethnomethodology*. Englewood Cliff: Prentice-Hall.

Gaztambide-Fernández, Rubén. 2006. *Lives of distinction: Ideology, space, and ritual in processes of identification at an elite boarding school*. Ph.D. Diss., Harvard University.

Glaser, Barney. G., and Anselm L. Strauss. 1967. *The discovery of grounded theory: Strategies for qualitative research* (fourth paperback printing, 2009). Piscataway, NJ: Transaction publishers. Retrieved from www.books.google.com.

Goffman, Erving. 1959. *The presentation of self in everyday life*. New York: Anchor.

———. 1961. *Asylums: Essays on the social situation of mental patients and other inmates*. Garden City, NY: Anchor Books.

Hall, Stuart, and Paul de Gilroy. 1992. *Questions of cultural identity*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Hochberg, Gil Z. 2006. Edward Said: "The last Jewish intellectual" on identity, alterity, and the politics of memory. *Social Text* 24: 47–65.

Marshall, Mark. 1995. Rethinking the Palestine question: The apartheid paradigm. *Journal of Palestine Studies* 25 (1): 15–22.

Massad, Joseph. 2005. The persistence of the Palestinian question. *Cultural Critique* 59 (Winter): 1–23.

Mead, George H. (1934) 1967. *Mind, self and society*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

The Palestine Youth Orchestra (PYO). [Press release]. 2015. Ramallah, Palestine: Edward Said National Conservatory of Music.

Said, Edward W. 1974. Arabs and Jews. *Journal of Palestine Studies* 3 (2): 3–14.

———. 1979. *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage Books.

———. (1979) 1992. *The question of Palestine*. New York: Vintage Books.

Scott, James C. 1989. Everyday forms of resistance. *Copenhagen Papers* 4: 33–62.

Small, Christopher. 1998. *Musicking: The meanings of performing and listening*. Middletown, CT, USA: Wesleyan University Press.

Note

¹ Rima is referring to the Palestine Strings performance at the 2013 London Proms (see, for instance, http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/middle-east/palestinian-orchestra-takes-centre-stage-at-the-proms-with-kennedy-s-support-8744306.html)

About the Authors

Carol Frierson-Campbell is associate professor of music at William Paterson University of New Jersey, where she teaches undergraduate and graduate courses in instrumental music education and research and coordinates the music education program. Her scholarly interests include music education in marginalized communities, instrumental music education, and research pedagogy. During the 2015-2016 school year she served as Scholar in Residence at the Edward Said National Conservatory of Music in the occupied Palestinian Territories. She previously has co-authored (with Hildegard Froehlich) the textbook *Inquiry in Music Education: Concepts and Methods for the Beginning Researcher*, edited the 2-volume *Teaching Music in the Urban Classroom*, and authored articles in *Music Education Research* and *Arts Education Policy Review*.

Keumjae Park is Associate Professor of Sociology at William Paterson University of New Jersey. Her primary research areas are immigration, gender, and identity. She is particularly interested in migration within Asia, human rights of immigrants, and transnational identities. She enjoys teaching social theories and courses on gender and globalization, and loves mentoring student research.