Action, Criticism & Theory for Music Education ISSN 1545-4517

A refereed journal of the



Action for Change in Music Education

Volume 15 Number 1 January 2016

Special Issue: El Sistema

Geoffrey Baker, Guest Editor

Vincent C. Bates, Editor

Brent C. Talbot, Associate Editor

"The feelings have come home to me." Examining advertising films on the Swedish website of El Sistema

Anna-Karin Kuuse, Monica Lindgren, and Eva Skåreus

© Anna-Karin Kuuse, Monica Lindgren, and Eva Skåreus. 2016. The content of this article is the sole responsibility of the authors. The ACT Journal and the Mayday Group are not liable for any legal actions that may arise involving the article's content, including, but not limited to, copyright infringement.

Special Features: For optimal viewing and to access endnotes and citations by simply placing the cursor over the corresponding number and date, download and open this document in Adobe Reader.

"The feelings have come home to me." Examining advertising films on the Swedish website of El Sistema

Anna-Karin Kuuse, Monica Lindgren, and Eva Skåreus Umeå University

The purpose of this study is to analyze how the music educational program of El Sistema Sweden is advertised and legitimized through moving images. The films are a major part of the information on the Swedish national website of El Sistema and are supposed to contribute to the picture that the organization and its founders wish to market. The use of moving images and sounds, actors, backgrounds and environments, artefacts, and music in two short films are analyzed with the help of discursive tools from discourse theories, multimodal analysis, and pictorial semiotics. From a social constructionist perspective, and within a frame of contemporary debates within music education and philosophy of music, the article argues for the need to consider both governing moral values and the objectification of music when making claims for social development and integration through music education.

Keywords: El Sistema, music education, multimodal analysis, film analysis, social discourse, rhetorical constructions

been implemented in the Swedish music educational field. Mainly municipally and tax-financed, it is organized through community schools of music and arts and in collaboration with compulsory schools. With its claims of social integration, this music education program has attracted great attention and funding, which may be seen in the light of recent debates in the media and in social research concerning segregation in schools in Sweden. Since the 1990s, national debates, both political and scholarly, have examined these new challenges to Swedish society, considering school policy and inequalities of school choice, as well as performance and segregation issues, which have increased due to socio-economic

changes and immigration (Arnesen and Lundahl 2006; Beach and Sernhede 2011; Lundahl 2002).

El Sistema has organized orchestral and choral after-school education for an increasing number of Venezuelan children since the 1970s. As advertised and quoted both in Venezuela and worldwide, the program claims that it pursues both musical excellence and social development and is aimed primarily at children living in poverty (Uy 2012). The Venezuelan showcase ensemble, the Simón Bolívar Symphony Orchestra (SBSO), performs internationally with highly professional players educated within the program. The conductor of the SBSO, Gustavo Dudamel, and the founder of El Sistema, José Antonio Abreu, are the program's stars and ambassadors (Tunstall 2012). Inspired by the documentary *Tocar y Luchar* (to play and to fight) and other sensationalized media stories about the program in Venezuela, increasing numbers of people overseas have sought to replicate its success (Uy 2012). After taking root in the United States and Scotland, the implementation of El Sistema programs is continuing to spread internationally, influenced by the claims for humanistic, democratic, and artistic outcomes in communities in Venezuela.

Hammarkullen, a suburb of Gothenburg, was the first district in Sweden to implement a replica program, initiated by the head conductor of the Gothenburg Symphony Orchestra (GSO) at the time. Gustavo Dudamel has since then collaborated with the GSO as a patron for the program. Initially El Sistema was implemented in collaboration with city communities and the existing after-school provision—the community schools of music and arts. Organizing group musical training for pre-school and primary school children, this structure provided skilled music teachers with locales and a base for funding as well as already established cooperation with compulsory schools. The foundation of El Sistema Sweden was created to strengthen the program, while retaining the community focus. Apart from tax funding, the Swedish program received various kinds of external funding. Replicating the Venezuelan origins, orchestral and choral ensembles were prioritized. El Sistema Sweden has now been implemented in every city district in Gothenburg, and in fifteen cities across the country (www.elsistema.se).

In general, children's music education in Sweden is mandatory, with weekly school music sessions. Music education is, as mentioned above, also offered as an after-school choice in community schools of music and arts. Mandatory school music has curricular programs and reaches every child, teaching basic musical skills, while the after-school programs offer individual musical instrument studies, ensembles, orchestras, and choirs, all with opportunities to perform. After-school sessions are subject to an annual fee, which is subsidized by tax revenues. El Sistema's contribution within this organization, besides the claim for social learning, consists of ventures in group learning and a strong focus on orchestras and choirs. Compared with music education in compulsory schools, which in Sweden is dominated by pop and rock music (Lindgren and Ericsson 2010), El Sistema provides opportunities to learn and play Western art music. El Sistema's implementation in new city areas makes music education more accessible and thereby offered to groups not normally reached by after-school music education (Bergman and Lindgren 2014a; Bergman and Lindgren 2014b). However, the claim for social change through music education has to be analyzed further.

Aesthetic, praxial or social

As one of many philosophical discussions within the scholarly field of music education, a debate concerning musical learning as aesthetic (Reimer 1989) or praxial (Bowman 2005; Elliott 1995) has been of considerable importance. The former presents the object of music as inherently aesthetic, whereas the latter focuses on social relations forged through creative and situated learning in music education. Referring to Dewey ([1934] 1980), Westerlund (2003) argues that ethical and aesthetic learning can never be separated from social relations, and the debate on musicking (de Nora 2000; Small 1998), advocating praxial views, views music as a socially situated meaning-making activity. Discussing musical participation and communities of musical practice, both Barrett (2005) and Turino (2008) outline complex inter-woven relationships between social and aesthetic musical work.

Tracing the notion of aesthetics in the philosophy of music, music essentialism still seems present, reconstructing the discourse of musical autonomy (Pontara 2007, 230). Though the praxis of El Sistema Sweden can be seen as a negotiation between

culturally conservative and radical democratic discourses (Bergman and Lindgren 2014a), recent Swedish music education research presents musical learning as a context-dependent socio-cultural praxis (Lindgren and Ericsson 2010; Kullenberg 2014; Wallerstedt et al. 2014).

Claims by El Sistema that their choir and orchestra schools improve social development through music education place the program in negotiation with both recent music education research and the media debate around Swedish schools (Bergman and Lindgren 2014a; Bergman and Lindgren 2014b). Programs emanating from the Venezuelan model and its socio-musical emphases and visions keep growing in number. Still, scholarly interest in El Sistema has just begun. In an attempt to evaluate the program, an international research review (Creech et al. 2013) presented findings focused mainly on social and integrative claims. While Tunstall (2012) and Uy (2012) merely outline the program and its intentions, Baker (2014), in contrast, discusses disciplinary issues and power in the Venezuelan case, deeply questioning ideological and economic grounds for claiming social justice through music. With concern for children's music education at large, Baker argues for scrutinizing the Venezuelan model before replicating it. The emphasis on Western art music as a culturally conservative discourse and the lack of reflection on issues of inclusion and exclusion have been discussed critically in both Sweden and Scotland (Allan 2010; Bergman and Lindgren 2014a; Bergman and Lindgren 2014b). Although El Sistema research has just started and no Swedish evaluations have been made, the claim of social development through group music training in orchestras and choirs is persistently argued without any scholarly support.

Aim and questions

Departing from scholarly debates concerning music education, combined with a critical stance concerning how and in what ways its implementation is publicly argued for (Blommaert 2005, 2010, 2013; Bradley 2009; Talbot 2013; Foucault 1977, 1983, 1988), this study will concentrate upon communicational strategies on the website of El Sistema Sweden (www.elsistema.se). The foundation El Sistema Sweden runs the program and its associated website, which provides a wide range of promotion, information, and marketing about the program for members and for the

public. It networks with Sistema Europe and Sistema Global, two international advocacy groups, and manages certification for the creation of new programs. As the only public channel promoting El Sistema in Sweden, the website is an important source for shaping the very distribution of "language as a complex of resources" (Blommaert 2010, 28) and constructing meaning in and about the program. A large proportion of the online information consists of pictures and film material. This article examines this material and poses two further questions: How is El Sistema Sweden legitimized in two films on the website? And in what way is music constructed within this legitimation?

Theoretical framework

Taking a social constructionist and critical perspective on pedagogical implementation concerning children at large, the mechanisms of governing through discourses operate by implicit normalization and control of the child (Foucault 1977). This system of governing and normalization produces what is perceived as a "good pedagogy" (Walkerdine 1995, 163) and provides rhetorical and ideological rationales for mechanisms of governing (Rose 1995). The family, the free child, criminality, and poverty (Walkerdine 1995) are examples of domains specifically constituted to receive rational interventions by policy and expertise with the help of education (Rose 1995). Education seen as moral fostering and modelling of the disadvantaged (Foucault 1983) was, for example, an important argument in the late eighteenth century, when mandatory education was instituted in England (Walkerdine 1995). In Sweden, similar objectives were argued when organizing adult education for the working classes in the nineteenth century, and such objectives share several ideological rationales with the implementation of El Sistema in Sweden (Bergman and Lindgren 2014b).

Governing power in education may in this way operate through what Foucault (1983, 1988) denominates as *pastoral power*, distinguished by the spiritual caring for all members of a well-defined group. With its roots in monastic religious communities, this power, according to Foucault, is transported into modern society, governing how to handle issues of health, wellbeing, and safety. Representatives work in healthcare and social agencies, welfare policy, and administration, aiming to

model individuals "for their own best" (Nilsson 2008, 147). Pastoral power works with soft techniques — helping, instructing, and caring — as governing instruments.

This study is based on the view that discourses and governing mechanisms are constituted not only verbally, but also and as much by other mediations (Blommaert 2005). These different representations keep influencing actions, rituals, and practices (Fairclough 1995; Lacleau and Mouffe 1985), where further struggles for the claim of truth are performed. The analysis of discourses provides an opportunity to disclose how negotiations of meaning are made, what kinds of truth and knowledge are produced, and how discursive borders appear. Production of meaning within those borders is regulated and stabilized and creates a foundation or hegemony (Lacleau and Mouffe 1985) for actions inside the discourse (Lindgren 2006). The hegemony constitutes meaning even for material parts such as actions, relations, and artefacts. By mapping rhetorical constructions (Potter and Wetherell 1987; Potter 1996) constituted by several different mediations in two films from the Swedish website of El Sistema, this study will discuss the perceived governing mechanisms (Fairclough 1995), thereby scrutinizing rationales for implementation.

Empirical data

On the Swedish Sistema website, the core written text concerning social objectives states that the program will contribute to increased integration and stronger democratic development, as well as supporting and caring for children's upbringing, helping them to reach their full potential. Films published on the website are regarded as contributing to those main arguments. When analyzing these multimodal forms of communication discursively, this study relies on critical stances inspired and contributed by Blommaert (2005, 2010, 2013), Jocuns (2007, 2009), and, in music education research, Talbot (2013) and Bradley (2009).

Empirical data consists of two films chosen as representations of content in the media section on the site. There were at the moment of selection, December 2014, a total of twenty films available under the "Media" link and the subsections "Film/Movies" and "Other film material." The films chosen are professionally produced, using effective dramaturgical constructions and showing both social and musical settings accompanied by music and sounds. They represent two very

different contexts, but were selected due to similar effective dramatizing and advertising of El Sistema. Looking through all the films, they appear to be less documentaries about music education than "infomercials" (Baker 2014, 256) — informative films, often with voice-overs and non-diegetic music, containing actions and images designed to sell a product.¹

The film from the Swedish setting is 4'12" minutes long, and shows the suburb of Hammarkullen, where El Sistema was first implemented in 2010.² The plot or dramaturgy of the film depicts the life of a family with two children partaking in an El Sistema program. The title, "El Sistema Hammarkullen and the preparation of a concert at the big stage of Liseberg," discloses the music education aspect. Music from children practicing accompanies almost all of the film.

The Venezuelan film, 2'59" minutes long, is a trailer for the film *El Sistema*.³ As the sole film from Venezuela placed on the Swedish website, it is here interpreted as a connection to the source and history of the program. The film depicts children, mostly without adults, in the city of Caracas, exposed to traffic and city environments or partaking in musical activity within El Sistema. Children and the founder of the Venezuelan Sistema verbally endorse the need for, and benefits of, the program. Classical music accompanies the moving pictures throughout the film.

Methodology

Barthes' (1977) concepts of connotation have been used in our analysis as: sound/music, objects, poses, and settings. Connotative use of such multimodal signs adds meaning to the film composition. The representation of social actors and actions, different modalities of presentation, distance, angle, and gaze, as well as framing, background, and light, are important mediators of discourse (Jocuns 2007, 2009). Absent or distanced representations of social actors in the films are, as an illustration, connoted as them being excluded, without agency, stereotyped or categorized (Machin 2004, 2007).

By mapping the rich multimodal dramaturgy, considering everything as text, our analysis will define this array of different features as a multimodal matrix, which may be analyzed with concepts from discourse theories and discourse psychology, with the help of multimodal analysis and pictorial semiotics (Barthes 1977;

Blommaert 2005, 2010, 2013; Machin 2004, 2007; Marner 1995; Skåreus 2009, 2011; Sturken and Cartwright 2009). Rhetorical constructions from this matrix are regarded as holding equivalent ties of meaning where recurrent indexical combinations of signs and multimodal devices are articulated (Potter and Wetherell 1987; Potter 1996; Winther-Jørgensen and Phillips 2000; Blommaert 2005). The discursive rhetorical constructions connected to music and the program are further interpreted as legitimizing El Sistema (see Talbot 2013 for discourse analysis and music education). Looking at the function or effect of such rhetorical constructions, they articulate what is accepted and highly valued, as well as highlighting discursive borders (Blommaert 2005, 2010; Holmberg 2010). Discourses are regarded in this study as productive, constituting both language and actions, setting hegemony in constant negotiation (Lindgren and Ericsson 2010). To contrast discursive constructions that are seemingly ordinary, normative, and familiar with others perceived as strange and deviant is further analyzed as constituting discursive borders (Holmberg 2010; Marner 1995; Skåreus 2009, 2011). In the same way, the assumed "preferred reading" (Skåreus 2011, 123; Sturken and Cartwright 2009, 53) of pictures or moving images discloses the producers' intended reading of such a composition. Film utterances expressed in multimodal signs, speech, and written text all contribute to building rhetorical constructions that constitute and govern meaning inside the discourse. In this study, such constructions will be identified and will constitute the core of analysis.

A timetable describing the film dramaturgy through connotative categories of music/sound, actors, actions, scenery, and text/speech has been used in transcribing the data. A short part of the Swedish film (27 seconds) is depicted and denoted in a table below, with timings on the left. Events in all categories are listed chronologically in order to map what is happening horizontally.

Film 00.00-00-27

Time	Sound/	Actors	Actions	Scenery	Text/Speech
	Music				
00.00	Music - practice Babumba, continues	Girl	Plays violin lies down	Home setting. Bed full of teddy bears	
00.03			Sits on her bed	Frog-perspective, rose room, rose bed	
00.12				Double flat building with parabolic aerial, tree, fence	
00.14	Sounds of frying in a pan		Hands cooking food, picks in cupboard	Picture on frying- pan, somebody is cooking seen from back	
00.16		Mother		Close picture from back, home	
00.18	Ode to Joy on piano	Boy (Alan)	Plays piano with one finger, neck, half face	Close picture from back by the piano	Name on screen: Alan
00.22		Girl (Vian)	Lies in bed playing	Frog perspective bed	Name on screen: Vian
00.24		Boy	Hand plays one finger piano		
00.27			-		

The whole films were transcribed in tables with dramaturgical events presented as soon as anything in any category happened or changed. Excerpts for analysis were selected when and where the multimodal matrix clearly collaborated in a rhetorical construction. Tables have further been converted to depictions in narratives that summarize what happened horizontally and chronologically.

Analysis of rhetorical constructions

The two films are regarded here as advertising the program of El Sistema and, as such, are supposed to contribute to the picture the organization and its founders wish to market. In this way, it resembles the website of any school or organization designed to attract pupils or members. What will be analyzed further is *how* in this case the music educational program legitimizes its implementation with the help of a

composition of multimodal indexical devices. In the analysis of the transcriptions, recurrent themes appeared concerning music, family, and feelings. Those themes, tied to each other, constitute the rhetorical constructions most frequently articulated, and in this study they are presented as: *Music as harmony*; *music saving families*; and *music and feelings as moral fostering*.

"You show your feelings": Music as harmony

In the Swedish film, time is clearly devoted to family matters. The family is constructed normatively as a traditional Swedish middle-class family, having a special quality and meaning in life thanks to music and the service of El Sistema. The object of music is obviously connected to what are regarded as social values and the harmonious home on screen. Musical sounds dramatize and accompany the story, serving more as background than foreground, framing narratives of family, music, feelings, and social life.

Excerpt 1

00.27 The mother is working in the kitchen and, shortly after, sitting on the sofa talking directly to the camera. The children's musical practicing continues in the background and the living room is depicted with curtains and light from the window behind the sofa. She is talking to the camera:

To hear music in <u>our</u> home, it is... I am really grateful that the kids have the opportunity to learn music...

00.40 While talking, the camera zooms really close to her face:

...the music is following them all their life, it enriches their souls.

The children are continuously playing violin and piano. This music, framing the home environment and given an active role, gives, as the mother explains, something very special to the family, for which she is grateful and from which they benefit. The zooming in on the mother's face functions to strengthen the somewhat mystical statement about the children's souls and the excerpt may be analyzed as expressing a normative view of the object of music, indexically indicated as providing harmony and moral shaping (Potter 1996; Gumperz 1982; Blommaert 2005, 2010). The mother's utterance, with the amplified "our," and the statement about the children's

enriched souls become convincing as a rhetorical strategy by the way she is portrayed as a personal witness of the change in their home and the children's lives due to El Sistema (Potter 1996).

The pictures of the home environment and the music practiced (the sonic framing), indexically tied to the utterance (Winther-Jørgensen and Phillips 2000; Blommaert 2005, 2010), articulate the presence of social values and harmony inside their home.

Excerpt 2

00.47 The father is now presented sitting alone on the sofa, talking straight to the camera:

There are no prejudices in music...

oo.52 The whole family sits close together on the sofa, while music is playing. They all look happy and smiling. There are burning candles and fruits on the table in front of the sofa, and everyone looks silently into the camera. The father's voice continues as a voice-over for the scene:

...you play and you show your feelings...

oo.56 The father appears alone on the screen again, sitting on the sofa and talking directly to the camera. The sound of music practice continues. He is serious and persuasive, talking with intensity and without smiling:

...and those feelings have come home to me. We are El Sistema.

01.01 The music practicing ends. The whole family sits together in the kitchen eating dinner. They chat and we hear clear, distinct, and amplified noise from kitchen cutlery instead of music. From outside the kitchen door, we view the family in a safe and warmly lit environment. 01.05

The parents both state that they have received something from the music and El Sistema that they did not have before in their home; the music has enriched them with good feelings and brought this home to them. The multimodal matrix, using familiarizing (Marner 1995; Skåreus 2009, 2011) kitchen noise and depictions of the sofa, a warmly lit, well-organized home environment, and happy, contented family members, constructs an order of social values particularly addressed to the Swedish public using indexes of a grateful family and a seemingly harmonious home life. The utterance about "no prejudices," framed by multimodal devices and foregrounding

the father, functions as a contrasting device, and constitutes borders with a society outside of the harmonious home and the El Sistema program, a society then presumed to consist of prejudices.

With images of lonely children and groups of children in areas connoted as dangerous (for example, with traffic jams, pictures of weapons, alarming music) and without adult leadership, the Venezuelan trailer uses contrast to produce an effect, underlining the need for music and the organization of El Sistema. The non-diegetic music dramatizes the images with frequently changing musical themes, though the fact that the music performed by the depicted children is replaced by a professional recording undermines an important Sistema idea—that musical excellence and social transformation can go hand in hand.

Excerpt 3

oo.oo Distinct trumpets, horns, and percussion open the scene of a big city viewed from a distance, surrounded by mountains.

oo.o3 Music is played forte while zooming to the city center; sounds from traffic and sirens are mixed with strong music. Pictures of an election advertisement in red; a red car passes.

00.04 Shown from a distance, a child passing in a car, young boys running through the traffic or standing beside the street. There are many cars and decrepit houses. There are pictures of rebels with weapons on the walls. It is messy, dirty, crowded, and there is a lot of traffic.

00.06 Two small girls are running through the traffic with big food bags. We look closely at a sad face of a youth (00.08), of boys playing basketball in between houses (00.09), of young boys playing in a corridor (00.12).

Unlike the Swedish film, constructions of children in contexts of social vulnerability disclose several short sequences of people in need. The film starts from a state of urgency, dramatized by alarming music. Multi-modally, the sequences use rhetorical devices to convey that something has to be done, that children are in danger. The pictures, the quantity of different actors and actions, traffic jams, decrepit houses, noise, red colors, alarming music, and children looking sad and lost, all come together to index the same construction of non-harmony.

The next excerpt presents the Venezuelan leader of El Sistema, José Antonio Abreu. The need for inclusion in the musical program is constructed in contrast to the exclusion presented earlier by the use of devices expressing urgency and social vulnerability. This exclusion, he states, is the cause of all social problems. The music (see Excerpt 4) used to dramatize the moving images when illustrating the quoted "social problems" is no longer alarming, but rather performed in a melodic, emotional, full, minor-key orchestration.

Excerpt 4

o2.00 The founder Abreu speaks again. As he has already been presented he can now voice-over the coming images. The ongoing orchestral music decreases dynamically. An adult male is looking out from an open window in the city; laundry is hanging around him. Another man stands on a balcony, depicted without a shirt; yet another man works with laundry. A small girl is sitting alone on stairs by a rough house surrounded by laundry. During these scenes the voice explains:

In my view, the root cause of all our social problems is exclusion. We want to fight to ensure that a larger number of people...

02.10 The leader is depicted back in his light room, dressed in a dark coat. A white shirt and tie are visible. He wears a gold watch and appears in close-up from the front, gesturing and smiling while speaking further, expressing strongly the word "everyone":

...everyone, if that's possible, has access ... to this wonderful world...

02.13 ...the world of music, the world of the orchestra, the world of song... Children are clapping their hands, smiling while doing choreography with their arms, accompanying this statement.

o2.16 There are leaders looking at the children, a close-up picture of one girl happily doing the movements, and finally many children on chairs in lines doing that same choreography.

02.20 Abreu appears again in his room and ends the speech while smiling: ...the world of art!

Taking part in the musical activities of El Sistema is presented, through a combination of pictures and utterances, as a moral good, providing access to desired values of citizenship, organization, and civic stability. It stands in strong contrast to other pictures of passive adults and the quote about exclusion. Musical activities

within the program are constructed as being the only places where children seem to be in harmony and happy, depicted with clapping hands and smiling. This scene, in turn, is also contrasted with the lonely girl on the stairs. The leader is presented separately, dressed up and in a close-up shot, contrasting with the passive people in the street, and given a calm, brightly lit room while speaking. Music as the object of the program is here constructed to act as a kind of soft rescuer (Foucault 1983), creating harmony and promising that *everyone* (the word is emphasized) could be included in the "world of art," as expressed in Excerpt 4.

The excerpts above constitute the rhetorical construction *music as harmony* and serve to legitimate El Sistema as rescuer of children and families. The tool is the music offered within the program, and it is connoted with different feelings depending on inclusion in or exclusion from the program. Music is portrayed like a tool—when you put it in the hands of a child, it changes them, making their life harmonious.

"It wasn't the pain in my leg": Music saving families

The constructions of a family sharing a harmonious life together in the Swedish film are indexical linked to El Sistema and suggest that the program provides harmony to all the family through the object of music. The children are shown happy and practicing, doing what is expected of them in order to gain the benefits of the program. The home environment, pictures of the house, the kitchen, and the sofa present an image of a well-functioning ordinary family that is grateful to El Sistema. The sofa acts like a stage where the speeches are performed; it is the place where important statements are expressed and the family meets. The mother's emphasis on the music arriving in their home is expressed as a positive change for all the family due to El Sistema; the family is thus presented as a non-musical environment before the implementation of the program.

When constructing family life and salvation in the Venezuelan setting (Excerpt 5), contrast is used once more, with adults characterized from a distance as without agency and children exposed to violence and danger. The family communities are here constructed invisibly, although children express that they are concerned about their families and want to improve their prospects. The desired functions of such

indexical devices create favourable conditions for uptake (Blommaert 2005, 68), and the preferred reading of this film construction is then inseparable from values that are communicated. The music changes into melodic lines, dynamically growing along with the following narrative.

Excerpt 5

00.26 The city sounds disappear; alarming music turns to melodic strings and wind instruments playing in the background. The rhythmic pattern is soft and moderate. Alongside further images, a voice-over from a girl explains:

It was my first day in the chamber orchestra, so I wanted to be early...

There are small children coming in a line, carrying cellos, walking along a corridor and passing the camera. Suddenly an orchestral music lesson appears, with young children waving their bows above their heads, following a conductor. A happy, smiling girl in the orchestra appears in close-up.

oo.38 The music decreases in volume and the young girl appears again, sitting outside on a bench and talking. There are a wall and rough houses behind her while she speaks in close-up to the camera:

...but I got shot in the leg so I couldn't go. I started to cry, because...

00.42 ...it wasn't the pain in my leg...

Three young cellists are sitting by the traffic outside and playing; more children are shown playing together in the street, with trumpets and strings sounding in the background. The children look happy and interact. The girl continues her voice-over:

What really hurt was that I couldn't be in the orchestra that day. When I get there...

00.49 The girl appears again in close-up, showing her face, now smiling:

I forget everything else, everything ... everything.

00.51 The music changes and comes to a crescendo directly after her quote. Young violin and wind players are serious and concentrating, playing together in an orchestra.

The girl's testimony about her pain and the chance to forget everything legitimizes children's need for music as a saviour from their distressed social lives and violent circumstances. The dramatic musical crescendo and the possibilities of musical

inclusion represented by youngsters playing appear while she is talking about her longing to be in the orchestra. Dynamic changes in the music emphasize her feelings and give weight to the end of the quote — "everything."

The Venezuelan excerpts multi-modally construct a poor, crowded, noisy, violent, and insecure city, where children are trying to keep schooling and their musical activities intact. Orchestral music with drums and trumpets signifies danger and jeopardy and the need for commitment and strength. Verbal utterances construct the music as a saviour, a chance to forget about violence and improve the prospects for families, and a way to show prosperity despite living in a slum. The exceptional example (a girl who has been shot) functions as a strong legitimation for that salvation. No children in the Venezuelan trailer are depicted with responsible family members and the only adult constructed as a responsible father figure is the founder, Abreu. Contrasting with those devices of alarm and urgency, El Sistema is shown as acting to help, with children moving forwards in lines with their cellos and happy young performers directed and organized by adult leaders.

In the Swedish setting, El Sistema seems to be legitimated by an idea of music as something automatically improving the lives of children and their families. The whole family, and not just the children practicing, is shown to benefit from partaking in music, conveying harmony and gratitude due to El Sistema. Connecting to the website, quotes about democratic and integrative development indicate that families are supposed to be a part of that change. While in the Venezuelan film families are depicted in distress, without adult agency and responsibility, the family is still an important entity to be saved from exclusion, through the children. (In relation to the statements of the importance of the family, it seems like a paradox that the Venezuelan children are expected to invest a lot of time in El Sistema, away from their families.) Different ties between music, families, and salvation construct music as a way to be included and live in harmony, in contrast to exclusion, chaos, and danger. The family seems to be the important entity to reach with rational interventions (Rose 1995) in order to achieve the goal of inclusion.

"The kids are like bows": Music and feelings as moral fostering

Feelings of happiness, harmony, and gratitude are seemingly crucial signs in connection with El Sistema, as well as the achievement and commitment demanded from children following the program. Those feelings are frequently used, multimodally constructed and articulated in moving images, music, and speech. Feelings are expressed in the safe home environment in Hammarkullen, in the happy faces, in the music, and in verbal statements as *gratitude*.

00.27 (Mother) To hear music in <u>our</u> home, it is, I am really grateful that the kids have the opportunity to learn music...

Both parents in the Swedish setting state they have received something from the music and El Sistema, that it has enriched them with feelings:

00.40 (Mother) ...the music is following them all their life. It enriches their souls.

00.47 (Father) ...and those feelings have come home to me; we are El Sistema.

The statement of the father is made credible by the use of the inclusive "you" (bolded), claiming feelings of this kind to be normal and familiar for every human being:

00.52 (Father) ... you play and you show your feelings...

When using constructions of achievement and commitment to strengthen the rhetorical strategy about what El Sistema does for the children morally, the same "you" (bolded) is used for credibility, pointing to a generic and familiar understanding (Marner 1995; Skåreus 2009, 2011). Referring to indexical meaning, Gumperz (1982) developed the notion of contextualization, in which such verbal cues as "you" (repeated and bolded above) and "our" (amplified above) index a social and cultural pattern which becomes "rule or norm and so becomes an ideologically saturated behavioural expectation" (Blommaert 2013, 7). The sofa used as stage for the important utterances returns. The close zooming is recurrent and used for the climax of the statement:

Excerpt 6

02.02 The family children are framed actively engaging with their instruments (violin and xylophone) and we visit other children in the orchestra in close-up, as well as the conductor from different angles, mostly from the side and back, where we can see her role: to steer the big group of children. The parents are sitting on the first bench in front of the stage under an umbrella, looking happy throughout the whole part. // 03.31

03.32 In the last part, the father returns sitting on the home sofa. He gestures, imitating with his arms the use of a bow and arrow:

The kids are like bows, or the bow is what **you** hold in your hands and the arrow...

03.36 The camera zooms in on his face while he is looking straight into it; he continues with engagement:

...is in fact the kid, **you** bend and how much you bend, is how far **you** can send them."

o3.46 His children come into the picture at the end of the quote, happily riding on the big carousel together; the sky is visible. The music of the El Sistema song "Babumba" is still playing in the background; applause and happy shouting can be heard after the concert is finished.

We are to understand feelings as being directly tied to the program (Winther-Jørgensen and Phillips 2000). The feelings shown while happily riding and shouting, and the commitment depicted by leaders and engaged, concentrating children, may be analyzed as an order to construct credibility and legitimation. The use of a metaphor in the construction of the children as arrows, in the hands of the protecting and loving father, creates a poetic framing of educating the children in a gentle and non-disciplined way, with children flying high and far, illustrated by the metaphorical bent bow and the rhythmic music. *Happiness, harmony, gratitude*, and *commitment* construct the credibility of feelings and moral values that the music and the program contribute to.

In the Venezuelan trailer, the construction of feelings and morals starts from the articulation of urgency and the children's social vulnerability. Distress and serious minds are used to contrast with feelings of happiness and harmony within musical settings further on. Chaos contrasts with the good organization, and adult passivity contrasts with commitment and the promise of a better future. All the devices

contribute to building the rhetorical construction of music and feelings as moral fostering.

Excerpt 7

01.43 There is a calm, moving melody along with sounds of joy and happiness from young people. We look at a big group of very young children dressed in white, doing movements to a song.

Sounds of joy and happy children dressed in white, along with short sequences, non-diegetic musical moods, and environmental sounds, emotionally dramatize the musical setting, indexing it as providing solutions. The preferred reading from the excerpt above seems to familiarize and connect signs like calm music, joy, white clothes, and clear organization within the program of El Sistema, and emphasize the ties between music, feelings, and moral values. The estrangements and contrasts performed earlier make this reading even stronger.

The constructions from both films comprise private family and urgent social matters. The implementation meaning is constituted as possible inclusion in the world of music and feelings. Individual, familial, and social conditions are supposed to progress if the conditions are right. Connection to feelings is a crucial condition that is articulated, especially happiness. This condition is constructed as tied to the music and El Sistema. Commitment and musical practice demanded from the children advertize and connote the program as responsible, rescuing and saving through the object of music. Images construct the free and playful child with easy connections to feelings and the purity of art. Parents and society outside of El Sistema are portrayed as viewers and benefitting from the feelings given to the children. The program articulates inclusion, salvation, and feelings, together with commitment, and the professional leaders representing the program, depicted separately and briefly introduced, are to be the ones putting such processes into action. Some actors (children and passive adults) are presented as in need and having the chance to be modelled and to develop socially, while others (leaders and artists) are in charge, though they act not through interaction and relationships with the children, but rather through musical directing and the power invested in them by their profession.

Discussion

In short marketing films, the message must be effective, and the professionally conducted dramaturgy of infomercial devices must be well coordinated. These films are marketing a music educational idea with the help of social settings, produced concerts, and voice-overs concerning social outcomes. The use of well-produced narratives with several short sequences within a limited timeframe is analyzed here as constructing the intended portrayal of the program. The Venezuelan Sistema seems to be of great importance and value in the Swedish context and the choice of a family as an image for El Sistema Hammarkullen connects the program to normative values of well-functioning families and society in Sweden. El Sistema's legitimation through the films seems to rest on emotional and moral constructions as reasons for implementation. This legitimation also uncovers the construction of music as something essential, as an object, and sanctions the organization of settings where music is represented not just as an opportunity offered to children and families but also as a form of help or salvation associated with the development of cultural and moral values. Used in this way, the governing and soft discipline promoted within El Sistema Sweden seems a prerequisite for inclusion, an essential commitment to enable the child to reach their full potential. Efforts to market and legitimize the program tend to focus on the values of music as an object, rather than the specific values of music education.

These rhetorical constructions of El Sistema's social development claims raise questions when held up against the field of music education scholarship. Is it possible to claim social development without discussing music education as socially constructed and situated, as meaning-making and context-dependent, as outlined in praxial theories? In what ways do these rhetorical constructions relate to the notions of aesthetic meaning, participant communication, and agency inherent in lived musical communities (Westerlund 2003; Alperson 2010; Barrett 2005; Ansdell 2014)? Is asserting that families are benefiting from harmony and happiness, and that children can be modelled by music programs, revealing prejudiced views concerning segregation and cultural heritage? Is it possible to achieve social integration aims just by organizing musical events? The film's construction of music as an object, comprising values in itself, shapes actions and gives privileges to

professional actors within music education as the apparent owners of such values by dint of their musical profession. Does such musical authority give credibility to social development and inclusion efforts?

Contemporary music educational theorists (e.g. Alperson 2010; Bowman 2005; de Nora 2000: Small 1998; Westerlund 2003) discuss working with musical products as a musicking activity in an actual educational context and as an experience in time, holding negotiated individual, social, and aesthetic meaning. In fact, Westerlund (2003) argues, with the help of Dewey's ethics, that musicking is social and aesthetic because of the shared, experienced quality of action and not through the "universal property of an object" (46). Leaving behind the "object view" opens up a conception of music and music education as socially important when context, musical relations, quality of experience, and mutual meaning are considered.

The governing principles of music education in El Sistema, as represented in the films, seem to consist first and foremost of normative views, holding music as inherently connected to moral values, so that offering music education to those not previously reached by it will be life-changing in an obviously good way. As a social project in Swedish society in times of school segregation, El Sistema is offering a seemingly reasonable solution to social and educational problems. The rhetorical rationales of the films construct a legitimation that resembles governing with "health, wellbeing and safety" in mind and the modelling of children "for their own best" (Nilsson 2008, 147). However, interpreting the legitimation of El Sistema as a "good pedagogy" (Walkerdine 1995, 163) and enacted pastoral power (Foucault 1983, 1988), it is possible to question El Sistema's dependence on and propagation of normative views concerning children, families, and social outcomes. The filmic construction of a social music education discourse can in this way be regarded as intertextually linked to other educational and social discourses that sanction the domains of children, family, and segregated groups to receive rational interventions by society (Rose 1995).

Conclusion

This article has elaborated a micro-analysis of two advertising films on the Swedish Sistema website, focusing on the ways in which these films may be seen as rhetorical constructions rather than simply reflections of actual practice. The three key constructions of music identified are created first and foremost by the multimodal voice of the films and the website.

Since El Sistema is a music program for children, the filmic results may be discussed from an educational point of view. How the pedagogical practice of El Sistema works and what methods are used are completely silenced in the films. In the construction of *Music as harmony*, a naive view of music education is illustrated; for example, the hard musical practice necessary for becoming a musician is neglected. Pedagogical methods showing how social transformation could work hand in hand with the pursuit of musical excellence are also absent in the films. *Music as saving families* communicates the importance of the family, but the focus is more about conveying harmony within and gratitude for El Sistema than about children's musical development. Finally, *Music and feelings as moral fostering* could be strongly questioned from the perspective of regulating children's social and individual behaviour in the name of music education.

The films rest on and communicate several debatable ideas about music, education, and society. They may be regarded as manipulative for constructing children and families as non-musical and disoriented without the Sistema intervention. Particular socially excluded groups (e.g. in *barrios* in Venezuela) are portrayed as having special needs that can be met through music and El Sistema. The strong focus on orchestral and choral classical music, linked to moral values and cultural capital, is legitimized through discourses of harmony and salvation. This use of classical music education as charity and a route to salvation is closer to aesthetic discourses developed during the nineteenth century (Bergman and Lindgren 2014b) than to contemporary discourses about socially situated meaning-making activities (deNora 2000; Westerlund 2003).

El Sistema, according to our film analysis, claims grand outcomes that may be difficult to evaluate; the extent to which the films harmonize with the actual learning and teaching practices of El Sistema Sweden is difficult to say. In fact, published

research into the practices of El Sistema Sweden shows ambivalence towards aesthetic and educational values within the program (Bergman and Lindgren 2014a; 2014b), possibly attributable to the strong educational tradition of Swedish municipal music schools, as well as the hegemony of pop and rock music in Swedish compulsory schools. We argue for the need to scrutinize social claims for music education when both marketing and practically elaborating a program like El Sistema. The marketing especially is problematic and discloses areas of power distribution in need of further investigation. The results also have potentially significant implications for practice that are worth considering when implementing the program. Critical reflections on proposed social outcomes are vital in terms of praxial theories and in reforming and reconstructing music education in contemporary society.

References

- Allan, Julie. 2010. Arts and the inclusive imagination: Socially engaged arts practices and Sistema Scotland. *Journal of Social Inclusion* 1 (2), 111–22.
- Alperson, Philip. 2010. Robust praxialism and the anti-aesthetic turn. *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 18 (2), 171–93.
- Ansdell, Gary. 2014. *How music helps in music therapy and everyday life.* Farnham: Ashgate
- Arnesen, Anne-Lise, and Lisbeth Lundahl. 2006. Still social and democratic? Inclusive education policies in the nordic welfare states. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research* 50 (3), 285–300.
- Baker, Geoffrey. 2014. *El Sistema: Orchestrating Venezuela's youth.* New York: Oxford University Press.
- Barthes, Roland. 1977. *Image, music, text.* London: Fontana Press.
- Barrett, Margaret S. 2005. Musical communication and childrens' communities of musical practice. In *Musical communication*, edited by Dorothy Miell, Raymond MacDonald, and David J. Hargreaves, 261–80. New York: Oxford University Press.

- Beach, Dennis, and Ove Sernhede. 2011. From learning to labour to learning for marginality: School segregation and marginalisation in Swedish suburbs. *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 32, 257–74.
- Bergman, Åsa, and Monica Lindgren. 2014a. Studying El Sistema as a Swedish community music project from a critical perspective. *International Journal of Community Music* 7 (3), 365–37.
- Bergman, Åsa, and Monica Lindgren. 2014b. Social change through Babumba and Beethoven: Musical educational ideals of El Sistema. *Swedish Journal of Music Research* 96 (2), 43–58.
- Blommaert, Jan. 2005. Discourse. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- ——. 2010. *The sociolinguistics of globalization*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- ———. 2013. Ethnography, superdiversity and linguistic landscapes: Chronicles of complexity. Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Bradley, Deborah. 2009. Oh, that magic feeling! Multicultural human subjectivity, community, and fascism's footprints. *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 17 (1), 56–74.
- Bowman, Wayne. 2005. Music, beauty, and privileged pleasures: Situating fine art and 'aesthetic' experience. *Action, Criticism and Theory for Music Education* 4 (3), 109–131.
- Creech, Andrea, Patricia Gonzales-Moreno, Lisa Lorenzio, and Grace Waitman. 2013. *El Sistema—inspired programmes: A Literature Review of research evaluation and critical debates*. San Diego: Sistema Global.
- De Nora, Tia. 2000. Music in everyday life. Cambridge: University Press.
- Dewey, John. (1934) 1980. Art as experience. New York: Perigee
- Elliott, David. J. 1995. *Music matters: A new philosophy of music education*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Fairclough, Norman. 1995. *Critical discourse analysis. The critical study of language*. London: Longman.
- Foucault, Michel. 1977. Discipline and punish. London: Allen Lane.

- ——. 1983. Subject and power. In *Michel Foucault: Beyond structuralism* and hermeneutics, ed H.L. Dreyfus and P. Rabinow. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- ——. 1988. Politics and reason. In *Michel Foucault. Politics, philosophy, culture, interviews and other writings 1977-1984*, edited by L.D. Kritzman, 57–85. London/New York: Routledge.
- Gorbman, Claudia. 1980. Narrative film music. *Yale French Studies 60, Cinema/Sound*, 183–203.
- Gumperz, John J. 1982. *Discourse strategies*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Holmberg, Kristina. 2010. *Musik- och kulturskolan i senmoderniteten Reservat eller marknad*. Malmö: Liber.
- Jocuns, Andrew. 2007. Semiotics and classroom interaction: Mediated discourse, distributed cognition, and the multimodal semiotics of maguru panggul pedagogy in two balinese gamelan classrooms in the United States. *Semiotica: Journal of the International Association for Semiotic Studies/Revue De l'Association Internationale De Sémiotique* 164 (1-4), 123–51.
- Jocuns, Andrew. 2009. Participation structures as a mediational means: Learning balinese gamelan in the United States through intent participation, mediated discourse, and distributed cognition. *Mind, Culture and Activity* 16 (1), 48–63.
- Kullenberg, Tina. 2014. *Signing and singing: Children in teaching dialogues*. Göteborg: Göteborgs universitet.
- Lacleau, Ernesto, and Chantal Mouffe. 1985. *Hegemony and socialist strategy*. London: Verso.
- Lindgren, Monica. 2006. Att skapa ordning för det estetiska i skolan diskursiva positioneringar i samtal med lärare och skolledare. Göteborg: Göteborgs universitet.
- Lindgren, Monica, and Claes Ericsson. 2010. The rock band context as discursive governance in music education in Swedish schools. *Action, Criticism and Theory for Music Education* 9 (3), 32–54.
- Lundahl, Lisbeth. 2002. Sweden: Decentralisation, deregulation, quasimarket and then what? *Journal of Education Policy* 17 (6), 687–97.
- Machin, David. 2007. Introduction to Multimodal Analysis. London: Bloomsbury.

- ———. 2004. Building the world's visual language: The increasing global importance of image banks in corporate media. *Visual Communication* 3 (3), 316–36.
- Marner, Anders. 1995. Musikvideo och semiotik. In *Medietexter och medietolkningar*, eds. C-G. Holmberg and J. Svensson, 79–100. Otta: Bokförlaget Nya Doxa.
- Nilsson, Roddy. 2008. Foucault en introduction. Lund: Grahns tryckeri.
- Pontara, Tobias. 2007. Brev från den autonoma musikens värld. Den diskursiva konstruktionen av musikalisk autonomi i den samtida klassiska CD-skivan. Stockholm: Stockholms Universitet.
- Potter, Jonathan, and Margaret Wetherell. 1987. *Discourse and social psychology*. London: Sage.
- Potter, Jonathan. 1996. *Representing reality discourse, rhetoric and social construction*. London: Sage publications.
- Reimer, Bennett. 1989. A philosophy of music education. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Rose, Nikolas. 1995. Politisk styrning, auktoritet och expertis i den avancerade liberalismen. In *Foucault. Namnet på en modern vetenskaplig och filosofisk problematik*, eds. K. Hultqvist and K. Petersson, 39–59. Stockholm: HLS förlag.
- Skåreus, Eva. 2009. Pictorial analysis in research on education: Method and concepts. *International Journal of Research & Method in Education* 32 (2), 167–83.
- ——. 2011. Vinn deras hjärtan! om genus och emotioner i TV-serien klass 9A. *Tidskrift för Genusvetenskap* 2 (3), 117–44.
- Small, Christopher. 1998. *Musicking: The meanings of performing and listening*. Middletown, CT: Transaction Publishers.
- Sturken, Marita, and Lisa Cartwright. 2009. *Practices of looking An introduction to visual culture*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Talbot, Brent C. 2013. Discourse analysis as potential for re-visioning music education. *Action, Criticism and Theory for Music Education* 12 (1), 47–63.
- Tunstall, Tricia. 2012. *Changing lives Gustavo Dudamel, El Sistema, and the transformative power of music.* New York: W.W. Norton
- Turino, Thomas. 2008. *Music as social life The politics of participation*. New York/London: The University of Chicago Press.

- Uy, Michael. 2012. Venezuela's national music education program El Sistema: Its interactions with society and its participants' engagement in praxis. *Music and Arts in Action* 4 (1): 5–21.
- Walkerdine, Valerie. 1995. Utvecklingspsykologi och den barncentrerade pedagogiken: införandet av Piaget i tidig undervisning. In *Foucault. Namnet på en modern vetenskaplig och filosofisk problematik*, eds. K. Hultqvist and K. Petersson, 124–170. Stockholm: HLS förlag.
- Wallerstedt, Cecilia, Niklas Pramling and Roger Säljö. 2014. Learning to discern and account: The trajectory of a listening skill in an institutional setting. *Psychology of Music* 42 (3), 366–85.
- Westerlund, Heidi. 2003. Reconsidering aesthetic experiences in praxial music education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 11 (1), 45–62.
- Winther-Jørgensen, Marianne, and Louise Phillips. 2000. *Diskursanalys som teori och metod*. Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Notes

- ¹ Non-diegetic music is used to construct a mood in moving images, whereas diegetic music is the music performed or "issues from a source within the actual narrative" (Gorbman 1980, 197).
- ² The Swedish film is produced by Sergio Joselovsky with the support of Region Västra Götaland's Cultural Affairs Secretariat and the Foundation of El Sistema Sweden.
- ³ Smaczny, Paul, Stodtmeier, Maria and El Sistema 2015. *El Sistema*: http://www.elsistema.se. Speech and text in the Swedish film are translated to English by the authors.

About the Authors

Anna-Karin Kuuse is a PhD student in Educational Work/Music at the Department of Creative Studies, Umeå University where she belongs to the research school of Educational Science. She is a music teacher, music therapist and a teacher educator at the academy of Music and Arts, university of Gothenburg. Her PhD project is concerned with music education and social inclusion.

Monica Lindgren holds a PhD in Music Education and is professor at the Academy of Music and Drama, University of Gothenburg, Sweden. Her research interests are in the area of how ideals of knowledge, related to music and art, are created and ruled by specific governance strategies as well as music education in relation to social inclusion.

Eva Skåreus, is a Senior Lecturer in Art Teacher Education and Educational Work at Umeå University, Department of Creative Studies. She teaches graduate and undergraduate courses and supervises Ph.D. students. In her research Skåreus has mainly been concerned with issues of pictures/artwork, gender and teacher education in relation to professional identity. She has currently been working on a project about emotions and gender in education.